

**Development of nitride strengthened
nickel-chromium alloys for high
temperature applications**

A dissertation submitted to the
SWISS FEDERAL INSTITUTE OF TECHNOLOGY
in ZURICH
for the degree of Doctor of Technical Sciences

presented by
Claudio D. Penna
Dipl. Materials Science Eng. EPFL
born on May 9th, 1973
in Locarno (Ti)

Prof. Dr. Dr. h.c. Markus O. Speidel, examiner
Prof. Dr. Andreas Mortensen, co-examiner
Prof. Dr. Peter J. Uggowitzer, co-examiner

2002

Berichte aus der Metallurgie

Claudio Penna

**Development of nitride strengthened
nickel-chromium alloys for high
temperature applications**

Shaker Verlag
Aachen 2002

Die Deutsche Bibliothek - CIP-Einheitsaufnahme

Penna, Claudio:

Development of nitride strengthened nickel-chromium alloys for
high temperature applications / Claudio Penna.

Aachen : Shaker, 2002

(Berichte aus der Metallurgie)

Zugl.: Zürich, ETH, Diss., 2002

ISBN 3-8322-0516-0

Copyright Shaker Verlag 2002

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without the prior permission of the publishers.

Printed in Germany.

ISBN 3-8322-0516-0

ISSN 0945-0904

Shaker Verlag GmbH • P.O. BOX 101818 • D-52018 Aachen

Phone: 0049/2407/9596-0 • Telefax: 0049/2407/9596-9

Internet: www.shaker.de • eMail: info@shaker.de

*To my parents,
who provided the genetical
basis of this work*

Preface

This Ph.D thesis was carried out at the Institute of Metallurgy of the ETH Zurich under the supervision of Professor M. O. Speidel, to whom I would like to express my gratitude for giving me this opportunity and for according me a good deal of freedom and trust in this research.

I'm particularly thankful to Professor P.J. Uggowitzer and A. Mortensen for accepting to become co-examiner of this work. To Professor P. J. Uggowitzer and Dr. C. Solenthaler I'm deeply indebted for the various scientific discussions, help and revising of the manuscript.

To my office colleague and friend U. Wyss I would like to express my thankfulness for creating a comfortable working atmosphere, for the many many scientific discussions, for revising the manuscript and, last but not least, for the joint venture in the formation of the *Nickel Kompetenzzentrum* (NKZ).

Böhler GmbH is here to be cited for the financial support which made this project possible as well as for the large scale manufacturing of the alloys. Specially, the collaboration with Dipl-Ing. J. Bernauer (Böhler - Research & Development) was of great significance,

I'm also very thankful to Mister C. Wegman for solving most of the technical, and sometimes of weird nature, problems concerning most of the experimental tests carried out... and for the great „motivation shot“ which was granted me every morning by his *guete Morgä*.

I also would like to thank Dr. B. Lo Piccolo and Dr. R. Schaller (IGA - Physics Department- EPF Lausanne) for the useful discussions on micromechanisms in metals and for carrying out the internal friction experiments.

All the members of the Institute of Metallurgy who somehow contributed to this work, including the cooking skills, are here kindly acknowledged.

Finally, the support from my family and friends is not to be underestimated: a big thank to everybody.

Abstract

Nitrogen as an alloying element has been successfully used to develop a number of commercial steels in which it stabilizes the austenitic phase and allows the precipitation of nitrides. It is well established that interstitial nitrogen in steels causes a remarkably high strengthening and the mechanism is quite well understood. On the other side, a lot less is known on the properties of nickel-base alloys containing nitrogen.

This thesis describes the development of a new nickel-chromium alloy concept based on nitride stabilized grain boundary strengthening and solid solution hardening. The grain boundary stabilizing effect of nitrides and the properties of nickel-chromium alloys were combined in order to develop a new high temperature material.

By means of lab experiments combined with thermodynamical calculations and careful literature studies a suitable alloy composition was designed. In particular, this was selected in order to allow the manufacturing by ingot metallurgy, which had to be carried out under high nitrogen partial pressure in order to achieve sufficient nitriding.

Firstly, the properties of nitrified nickel-chromium alloys have been investigated in detail focusing on the influence of alloying elements on solid state and melt nitrogen solubilities, nitrogen solid solution strengthening at room and high temperature and the precipitation behavior. Technically and scientifically interesting achieved results include a remarkable nitrogen solid solution hardening at both room and high temperatures and the increased nitrogen solubility by chromium and tungsten addition.

Secondly, high nitrogen pressure melt nitriding was carried out to produce nitride strengthened polycrystalline nickel-25chromium-10tungsten alloys in the lab and their precipitation behavior, high temperature workability and thermal stability were investigated.

Finally, this alloy concept was transferred to large scale production and two loads with different compositions were produced by the industrial partner; their thermal stability and mechanical properties at room and high temperature were investigated, with particular emphasis on creep properties. The tensile strength of these new alloys resulted higher than that of comparable carbide strengthened nickel-chromium commercial alloys. The creep resistance was found to be strongly dependent on heat treatment affecting the precipitation state on grain boundaries. Interesting results were achieved at 800°C while at 1000°C the thermal stability of precipitates was not sufficient to hinder grain boundary sliding although higher strengths is expected with higher nitrogen contents.

Zusammenfassung

Durch Zulegieren von Stickstoff wurden zahlreiche kommerziell erfolgreiche Stähle entwickelt. Der Stickstoff als Legierungselement stabilisiert die Austenitphase und erlaubt die Nitridausscheidung. Interstitiell gelöst erhöht er durch eine ausserordentliche Mischkristallhärtung die Festigkeit erheblich und die dafür verantwortlichen Mechanismen werden ziemlich gut verstanden. Andererseits wurden die Eigenschaften von stickstoffhaltigen Nickelbasislegierungen viel weniger untersucht. Diese Dissertation beschreibt die Entwicklung eines neuartigen Nickel-Chrom-Legierungskonzeptes, welches auf nitrids stabilisierte Korngrenzen- und Mischkristallhärtung beruht. Der Korngrenzenstabilisierungseffekt der Nitride wurde mit den Eigenschaften der Nickel-Chrom-Legierungen kombiniert um einen neuartigen Hochtemperaturwerkstoff zu erzielen.

Eine geeignete Legierungszusammensetzung wurde mittels experimenteller Untersuchungen, parallellaufender thermodynamischer Berechnungen sowie durch eingehende Literaturrecherchen bestimmt. Dabei wurde besonders darauf geachtet eine schmelzmetallurgische Herstellung zu ermöglichen; dazu war ein Hochdruckverfahren notwendig um einen genügend hohen Stickstoffgehalt zu erreichen.

Zunächst wurden die Eigenschaften aufgestickter Nickel-Chrom-Legierungen im Hinblick auf den Einfluß der Legierungselemente auf die Stickstofflöslichkeit in der festen und flüssigen Phase, auf den Mischkristallhärtungseffekt des Stickstoffs und auf das Ausscheidungsverhalten untersucht. Technisch und wissenschaftlich bedeutend sind dabei der ausserordentliche Mischkristallhärtungseffekt durch Stickstoff bei Raum- sowie hohen Temperaturen und die Erhöhung der Stickstofflöslichkeit durch Zugabe von Chrom und Wolfram.

Danach wurden nitridverstärkte, polykristalline Ni-25Cr-10W-Legierungen durch Aufsticken bei einem hohen Stickstoffpartialdruck hergestellt und das Ausscheidungsverhalten, die Warmumformbarkeit und die thermische Stabilität untersucht. Schließlich wurde dieses Legierungskonzept für die Herstellung zweier industriell umgeschmolzener Grosschargen bei einem Industriepartner eingesetzt; dazu wurden zwei unterschiedliche Zusammensetzungen ausgewählt. Die thermische Stabilität sowie die mechanischen Eigenschaften bei Raum- und hoher Temperatur wurden mit besonderer Aufmerksamkeit auf das Kriechverhalten charakterisiert. Diese Legierungen weisen eine höhere Zugfestigkeit als vergleichbare kommerzielle karbidverstärkte Legierungen auf. Das Kriechverhalten ist stark vom Ausscheidungszustand an den Korngrenzen abhängig, welcher durch Wärmebehandlung gesteuert werden kann. Vielversprechende Ergebnisse wurden bei 800°C erreicht. Bei 1000°C reichte die thermische Stabilität der Nitride nicht mehr aus um das Korngrenzengleiten zu verhindern. Es wird jedoch bei dieser Temperatur eine höhere Kriechfestigkeit durch eine deutliche Erhöhung des Stickstoffgehaltes erwartet.

Riassunto

L'azoto come elemento di lega è ben conosciuto nell'ambito delle leghe ferrose, grazie al quale è stata sviluppata tutta una serie di acciai, nei quali questo elemento ha l'effetto di stabilizzare l'austenite e produrre precipitazione di nitruri. In questi acciai l'azoto in soluzione solida provoca un forte rafforzamento per soluzione solida e i meccanismi che lo determinano sono piuttosto ben conosciuti, mentre invece poco o nulla si conosce delle proprietà di leghe azotate a base di nichel e cromo.

Questo lavoro di tesi descrive lo sviluppo di un nuovo concetto di lega a base di nichel e cromo fondato sul rafforzamento per affinamento di grano stabilizzato da particelle di nitruri e sul rafforzamento per soluzione solida. Si tratta di associare l'elevata stabilità termodinamica dei nitruri, se confrontati ai carburi, e le proprietà delle leghe a base di nichel e cromo ottenendo così un nuovo materiale adatto per impieghi a temperature elevate.

Tramite esperimenti di laboratorio, simulazioni termodinamiche ed un attento studio della letteratura è stata elaborata una composizione chimica di lega tale da permettere la produzione per fusione, con la particolarità di dover essere eseguita sotto alta pressione per ottenere un alto contenuto di azoto.

In primo luogo sono state studiate in dettaglio le proprietà della lega nitrurata a base di nichel e cromo, analizzando in particolare l'effetto degli elementi di lega sulla solubilità dell'azoto in fase liquida e solida, il rafforzamento dovuto all'azoto in soluzione nonché il comportamento di precipitazione. In questo ambito i risultati tecnicamente e scientificamente più interessanti includono l'effetto particolarmente marcato di rafforzamento per soluzione solida, provocato dall'azoto a temperatura ambiente come a temperature elevate, e l'aumento della solubilità dell'azoto provocato dall'aggiunta di cromo o tungsteno.

Successivamente leghe policristalline a base nichel-25cromo-10tungsteno rafforzate da nitruri sono state prodotte per nitrurazione ad alta pressione in fase liquida. Queste leghe sono state in seguito caratterizzate per quanto riguarda i fenomeni di precipitazione, la malleabilità ad alta temperatura e la stabilità termica.

Finalmente il concetto di lega è stato trasferito su larga scala e due colate con due diverse composizioni chimiche sono state prodotte da un partner industriale; la stabilità termica e le proprietà meccaniche sono state studiate, prestando particolare attenzione al comportamento in condizioni di scorrimento viscoso (*creep*). La resistenza alla deformazione di queste leghe è superiore a quella di leghe commerciali comparabili, rafforzate da carburi. La resistenza al creep è risultata fortemente connessa allo stato di precipitazione ai bordi di grano, influenzato a sua volta dai trattamenti termici. Risultati interessanti sono stati ottenuti a 800°C mentre a 1000°C la stabilità termica dei precipitati non è risultata sufficiente per contrastare lo scorrimento dei bordi di grano; una migliore resistenza rimane comunque auspicabile aumentando considerevolmente il contenuto d'azoto.

Table of contents

1. Introduction	5
2. State of the art	7
2.1 General introduction to high temperature alloys	7
2.1.1 Ni-Cr-alloys and ordering	7
2.1.2 Superalloys	8
2.2 Alloy strengthening	11
2.2.1 Solid-solution strengthening	11
2.2.2 Particle strengthening	12
2.2.3 Grain boundary strengthening	12
2.2.3.1 Effect of temperature	13
2.3 Deformation at high temperatures	14
2.3.1 Critical features for high temperature materials	14
2.3.2 Thermal activation of dislocations	15
2.3.3 Creep	17
2.3.3.1 Creep mechanisms	18
2.3.4 Grain boundaries	22
2.3.4.1 Grain boundary migration	22
2.3.4.2 Stabilization of grain boundaries	23
2.3.4.3 Effect of applied stress on grain boundary sliding	25
2.4 Nitrogen and metal alloys	25
2.4.1 Nitrogen steels	25
2.4.2 Nitrides	27
2.4.2.1 π nitride	30
2.5 Aim of the project	30
3. Experimental procedure	33
3.1 Alloying	33
3.1.1 Low pressure melt nitriding	33
3.1.2 High pressure melt nitriding: lab scale alloy manufacturing	34
3.1.3 Solid state nitriding	35
3.2 Mechanical tests	35
3.3 Other characterizations	36
3.3.1 Chemical analysis	36
3.3.2 Dilatometry	36
3.3.3 Microscopy	36
3.3.4 Thermo-Calc calculations	37
3.3.5 Lattice parameter determination	37
3.3.6 Internal friction measurement	37

4. Nitrogen in Ni-Cr and Ni-Cr-W	39
4.1 Results	39
4.1.1 Nitrogen solubility	39
4.1.2 Nitride precipitation	43
4.1.3 Mechanical properties at room temperature	43
4.1.4 Mechanical properties at elevated temperature	46
4.1.4.1 Tensile properties	46
4.1.4.2 Creep properties	50
4.2 Discussion	54
4.2.1 Nitrogen solubility	54
4.2.2 Nitrogen precipitation	54
4.2.3 Mechanical properties at room temperature	55
4.2.4 Mechanical properties at elevated temperature	56
4.2.4.1 Tensile properties	56
4.2.4.2 Creep properties	57
5. Alloy development	61
5.1 Development strategy	61
5.2 Alloy composition: general considerations	63
5.2.1 Effect of chromium content	64
5.2.2 Effect of tungsten, molybdenum and tantalum additions	65
5.2.3 Effect of Al addition	66
5.3 Results	67
5.3.1 Alloy composition	67
5.3.1.1 Nitride stability	68
5.3.1.2 Effect of Mo, W and Ta	68
5.3.1.3 Effect of Al	71
5.3.2 Lab-scale alloy manufacturing	72
5.3.3 Industrial scale manufacturing - collaboration with Böhler GmbH	74
5.3.3.1 Pressure ESR: general considerations	74
5.3.3.2 Composition and microstructure	74
5.3.4 Mechanical properties	78
5.3.4.1 Tensile properties	78
5.3.4.2 Creep behavior	79
5.4 Discussion	84
5.4.1 Alloy composition	84
5.4.1.1 Cr effect and nitride stability	84
5.4.1.2 Effect of Mo W and Ta	84
5.4.1.3 Effect of Al	85
5.4.2 Microstructure	85
5.4.3 Lab scale manufacturing	85

5.4.4 Industrial scale manufacturing	86
5.4.4.1 Composition and microstructure	86
5.4.4.2 Tensile properties	87
5.4.4.3 Creep behavior	87
5.4.4.4 Summary of creep results and comparison with other alloys	88
6. Conclusion and outlook	91
6.1 Ni-25Cr-10W-Nitrogen system	91
6.2 Elevated temperature alloy development	91
7. References	93