

FROM CONFLICT TO CONSENSUS?

DISCOURSES ON GERMAN ENERGY TRANSITION

vorgelegt von
Dipl.-Biol. Anna Leipprand, M.E.S.
geboren in Stuttgart

von der Fakultät VI – Planen Bauen Umwelt
der Technischen Universität Berlin
zur Erlangung des akademischen Grades

Doktorin der Philosophie
- Dr. phil. -

genehmigte Dissertation

Promotionsausschuss:

Vorsitzende: Prof. Dr. Elke Pahl-Weber
Gutachter: Prof. Dr. Ottmar Edenhofer
Gutachter: Prof. Dr. Christian Flachsland
Gutachter: Prof. Dr. Ortwin Renn

Tag der wissenschaftlichen Aussprache: 4. September 2017

BERLIN 2017

Schriftenreihe der Reiner Lemoine-Stiftung

Anna Leipprand

**From Conflict to Consensus?
Discourses on German Energy Transition**

D 83 (Diss. TU Berlin)

Shaker Verlag
Aachen 2017

Bibliographic information published by the Deutsche Nationalbibliothek

The Deutsche Nationalbibliothek lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliografie; detailed bibliographic data are available in the Internet at <http://dnb.d-nb.de>.

Zugl.: Berlin, Techn. Univ., Diss., 2017

Copyright Shaker Verlag 2017

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without the prior permission of the publishers.

Printed in Germany.

ISBN 978-3-8440-5505-4

ISSN 2193-7575

Shaker Verlag GmbH • P.O. BOX 101818 • D-52018 Aachen

Phone: 0049/2407/9596-0 • Telefax: 0049/2407/9596-9

Internet: www.shaker.de • e-mail: info@shaker.de

Contents

Abstract	v
Zusammenfassung.....	vii
1 Introduction.....	1
1.1 The German Energiewende as a discursive process	1
1.2 Discourses, narratives and framings	2
1.2.1 Discourses.....	3
1.2.2 Narratives and framings	3
1.2.3 Actors and their discourses	6
1.3 Energy transition: milestones in policy and discourse developments	7
1.3.1 Dynamics originate in discourses over nuclear energy	10
1.3.2 Renewables support quietly sets energy transition in motion	11
1.3.3 Coal is today's elephant unwilling to leave the room	13
1.3.4 Insights from recent literature: actors, discourses and the science-policy interface ...	14
1.4 Objective and outline	16
1.5 References.....	18
2 Energy discourses in Federal Parliament 1989-2011	25
2.1 Introduction.....	27
2.2 Research design.....	28
2.2.1 Discourse analysis.....	28
2.2.2 Selection of time periods.....	30
2.2.3 Document sample	31
2.2.4 Coding and reconstruction of discourses and story-lines	32
2.3 Results	34
2.3.1 Two major energy discourses.....	34
2.3.2 Evolution of discourse	36
2.4 Discussion	42
2.5 Conclusions and outlook	45
2.6 References.....	46
3 Scientific policy advice in the German energy transition discourse.....	51
3.1 Introduction.....	53
3.2 Research design.....	54

3.2.1	Scientists and advocacy coalitions	54
3.2.2	Narratives as resources of ACF actors.....	55
3.2.3	Advocacy coalitions and discourses in the case study	56
3.2.4	Sample	59
3.2.5	Text analysis and coding.....	60
3.3	Results and discussion.....	61
3.3.1	Overview of SPA studies and issues	61
3.3.2	Advocacy and story-telling	62
3.3.3	Trends in SPA and evolution of discourses.....	65
3.4	Conclusions and policy implications.....	69
3.5	References.....	71
3.6	Annex A: List of SPA reports	76
3.7	Annex B: Institute names and abbreviations	79
4	The debate on the future of coal 2015-2016.....	81
4.1	Introduction.....	83
4.2	Research design.....	84
4.2.1	Theoretical framework.....	84
4.2.2	The German debate on the future of coal 2015-2016	86
4.2.3	Methodology and approach.....	88
4.3	Results and discussion	90
4.3.1	Framings	90
4.3.2	Actor mapping	95
4.3.3	Characterizing the solution space	97
4.4	Conclusions.....	100
4.5	References.....	101
4.6	Annex A: List of acronyms and abbreviations	107
4.7	Annex B: List of documents	108
5	Synthesis and outlook	111
5.1	Summary and discussion of findings	111
5.1.1	Energy transition: discourses and discursive dynamics	111
5.1.2	Scientific policy advice: advocacy enabling convergence	113
5.1.3	The future of coal: renewed conflict or final show-time?.....	114
5.1.4	Synthesizing results: from polarization to convergence?	115
5.2	Reflection on concepts and methods.....	116

5.3	Outlook.....	118
5.3.1	Energy narratives in a global climate governance perspective	118
5.3.2	Further research	119
5.4	References.....	120
Statement of Contribution.....		123
Tools and Resources.....		125
Acknowledgements.....		127