

Luft- und Raumfahrttechnik

Katharina Schäfer

Conceptual Aircraft Design for Sustainability

**SHAKER
VERLAG**

Conceptual Aircraft Design for Sustainability

Nachhaltigkeitsorientierter Flugzeugvorentwurf

Von der Fakultät für Maschinenwesen der Rheinisch-Westfälischen
Technischen Hochschule Aachen zur Erlangung des akademischen Grades
einer Doktorin der Ingenieurwissenschaften genehmigte Dissertation

vorgelegt von

Katharina Schäfer, geb. Franz

Berichter: Universitätsprofessor Dr.-Ing. Eike Stumpf
Außerplanmäßiger Professor Dipl.-Ing. Rolf Henke
Universitätsprofessor Dr. rer. nat. Johannes Reichmuth

Tag der mündlichen Prüfung: 09. Juni 2017

Berichte aus der Luft- und Raumfahrttechnik

Katharina Schäfer

Conceptual Aircraft Design for Sustainability

Shaker Verlag
Aachen 2018

Bibliographic information published by the Deutsche Nationalbibliothek

The Deutsche Nationalbibliothek lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliografie; detailed bibliographic data are available in the Internet at <http://dnb.d-nb.de>.

Zugl.: D 82 (Diss. RWTH Aachen University, 2017)

Copyright Shaker Verlag 2018

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without the prior permission of the publishers.

Printed in Germany.

ISBN 978-3-8440-5955-7

ISSN 0945-2214

Shaker Verlag GmbH • P.O. BOX 101818 • D-52018 Aachen

Phone: 0049/2407/9596-0 • Telefax: 0049/2407/9596-9

Internet: www.shaker.de • e-mail: info@shaker.de

Abstract

THE aim of this thesis is the development of a sustainability assessment methodology for application in conceptual aircraft design and its integration into an existing conceptual aircraft design environment. The key characteristics compared to the current state of the art is the consistent and quantitative assessment approach for the entire aircraft life cycle and the consideration of sustainability including economic, environmental, and social aspects.

The developed methodology is based on the theoretical concept of life cycle sustainability assessment (LCSA) comprising eco-efficiency analysis (EEA) and social assessment. Due to the different maturity and complexity levels of methods for EEA and social assessment, a successive process for LCSA is established in this thesis leading to the development of two methodologies: a streamlined eco-efficiency analysis (s-EEA) methodology for assessment of the complete aircraft life cycle towards selected economic and environmental impact categories, and a streamlined sustainability assessment (s-LCSA) methodology. The latter focuses on the eco-efficiency hot spot of the aircraft life cycle as determined by the s-EEA methodology and includes an indicator set with corresponding quantification methods for assessment of all three sustainability dimensions.

Quantification methods are developed, with which the corresponding impacts can be determined with the limited data available in conceptual aircraft design. In plausibility checks the methods demonstrate to provide the right order of impact magnitude. All methods are integrated into the conceptual aircraft design environment MICADO for sustainability assessment within the design loop. With this integrated assessment framework two comprehensive case studies are performed. The eco-efficiency assessment case study identifies several economic and environmental improvement potentials for the individual life cycle phases, and further the dominance of the operating phase with a contribution of 96.6 % to economic impact and 99.6 % to environmental impact. Therefore the s-LCSA methodology is focused on the operational phase and its applicability is demonstrated in the second case study, that outlines the potential to improve overall sustainability by operational modifications, retrofit, as well as aircraft redesign. The studies demonstrate, that without any cost increase, climate change impact can be reduced by slightly modified mission altitude and Mach number. And in case of redesign, even an improvement of all sustainability indicators is achievable. In summary, the results of this thesis underline the need for implementation of sustainability assessment into conceptual aircraft design.

Kurzfassung

ZIEL dieser Arbeit ist die Entwicklung einer Methodik zur Nachhaltigkeitsbewertung für den Flugzeugvorentwurf sowie deren Integration in eine existierende Flugzeugvorentwurfsumgebung. Die wesentlichen Eigenschaften verglichen mit dem Stand der Technik sind der durchgängige und quantitative Bewertungsansatz für den kompletten Flugzeuglebenszyklus sowie die Betrachtung der Nachhaltigkeit unter Einbezug ökonomischer, ökologischer und sozialer Aspekte.

Die entwickelte Methodik basiert auf dem Konzept der lebenszyklusbasierten Nachhaltigkeitsbewertung (LCSA), welches die Ökoeffizienz-Analyse (EEA) sowie die soziale Bewertung beinhaltet. Aufgrund des unterschiedlichen Reife- und Komplexitätsgrads der Methoden für EEA und soziale Bewertung wurde ein gestufter Prozess aufgestellt, der die Entwicklung zweier Methoden beinhaltet: die vereinfachte Ökoeffizienz-Analyse (s-EEA) zur Bewertung des kompletten Flugzeuglebenszyklus hinsichtlich ausgewählter ökonomischer und ökologischer Kriterien sowie die vereinfachte lebenszyklusbasierte Nachhaltigkeitsbewertung (s-LCSA). Letztere fokussiert auf die Lebenszyklusphasen, welche die s-EEA Methode als Hotspot identifiziert, und enthält Indikatoren mit dazugehörigen Quantifizierungsmethoden zur Bewertung aller drei Nachhaltigkeitsdimensionen.

Die entwickelten Quantifizierungsmethoden ermöglichen die Ermittlung der Ökoeffizienz- und Nachhaltigkeitskriterien trotz der im Flugzeugvorentwurfsstadium begrenzten Datenverfügbarkeit. Die Ergebnisse der Methoden, die in die Flugzeugvorentwurfsumgebung MICADO integriert werden, zeigen in den durchgeführten Plausibilitätsprüfungen die richtigen Größenordnungen. Mit dieser Bewertungsumgebung werden zwei umfangreiche Studien durchgeführt. Die Ökoeffizienz-Studie identifiziert mehrere Verbesserungspotentiale für die verschiedenen Lebenszyklusphasen sowie die Dominanz der Betriebsphase, die 96,6 % der Kosten und 99,6 % der ökologischen Auswirkungen verursacht. Aufgrund dieser Ergebnisse wird bei der s-LCSA Methode entsprechend auf die Betriebsphase fokussiert und die Gültigkeit der Methode innerhalb der zweiten Studie demonstriert. Die Studie zeigt, dass durch operationelle Anpassungen, Umbaumaßnahmen sowie Änderungen weniger Entwurfsparameter die Nachhaltigkeit im Flugbetrieb verbessert werden kann. So ist eine Reduzierung der Klimawirkung ohne eine Kostensteigerung durch eine geringe Anpassung der Reise Flughöhe und Machzahl möglich. Darüber hinaus ist mit kleinen Änderungen der Entwurfsparameter eine Verbesserung aller Nachhaltigkeitsindikatoren möglich. Zusammenfassend unterstreichen die Ergebnisse dieser Arbeit die Notwendigkeit, eine Nachhaltigkeitsbewertung im Flugzeugvorentwurf durchzuführen.

Acknowledgements

THE research of this thesis was conducted at the Institute of Aerospace Systems (ILR) of RWTH Aachen University and I sincerely thank Prof. Dr. Eike Stumpf, the head of institute, for supervising my thesis. Our fruitful discussions and his detailed revision highly contributed to this thesis and furthermore to its finalization. Likewise, I deeply thank Prof. Rolf Henke under whose guidance I started my work at the institute and who initiated the research topic of my thesis. I am very grateful for his continuous support from start to finish of the long journey on which he always challenged and encouraged me. Furthermore, I thank Prof. Dr. Johannes Reichmuth for being member of the thesis committee and Prof. Dr. Herbert Olivier for taking over the committee chair.

Special thanks goes to my colleagues and friends who made my time at the institute so memorable and enjoyable, despite or rather because of the many night shifts. I thank Dr. Kristof Risse who accompanied me from the first day of my studies in Aachen as great study partner, friend and, at my time at the institute, office colleague, the best I could wish for. I am very grateful for his support and his priceless advices that highly contributed to my research. I thank Eckhard Anton who introduced me to the world of aircraft design and supported me with countless hours of highly valuable discussions and programming lessons. I thank the academic council Dr. Ralf Hörnschemeyer for his ongoing encouragement especially at the final phase of my thesis. I am further thankful to Dr. Tim Lammering, Florian Schültke, Fabian Peter, and Dr. Abishek Sahai for their collaboration in aircraft design respectively sustainability analysis. This research originated from the RWTH ERS project ATLA and I thank all involved people for the great cooperation, especially Dr. Markus Große Böckmann. Furthermore, I thank all student workers who contributed to this thesis.

I am fortunate to have been surrounded by amazing friends during my years in Aachen, who kept me sane. I especially thank Dr. Hedi Bachmann who supported me during all the years and in the final stage gave me priceless advices for my thesis.

I deeply thank my family, especially my parents and grandparents for providing me the safe and supportive environment that gave me the backing and confidence to achieve the goals I have set for myself in life. My deepest gratitude goes to my husband Alexander and my son Elias who accompanied me along the challenging way and supported me altruistically, especially at the very end. I dedicate that work to you both, because without you I wouldn't have passed the finishing line.

Contents

List of Figures	XIII
List of Tables	XV
List of Symbols	XIX
1 Introduction	1
1.1 Review of Existing Research Activities	2
1.2 Gap Analysis and Research Objective	8
2 Fundamentals	11
2.1 Operationalization of Sustainability	11
2.1.1 Concept of Sustainability	12
2.1.2 Aspects	15
2.1.3 Indicators	16
2.2 Life Cycle Sustainability Assessment	21
2.3 Eco-Efficiency Assessment	22
2.3.1 Goal and Scope Definition	23
2.3.2 Environmental Assessment	24
2.3.3 Economic Assessment	26
2.3.4 Quantification of Eco-Efficiency	27
2.3.5 Interpretation	27
2.4 Social Life Cycle Assessment	28
2.5 Streamlined Approach	29
2.6 Approach and Focus of Thesis	30
3 Streamlined Eco-Efficiency Assessment Methodology	33
3.1 Aircraft Design Environment MICADO	33
3.2 Goal and Scope Definition	35
3.3 Economic Assessment	41
3.3.1 Development Costs	42
3.3.2 Production Costs	45

3.3.3	Operating Costs	46
3.3.4	End-of-Life Costs	50
3.3.5	Life Cycle Costs	52
3.4	Environmental Assessment	53
3.4.1	Development Resources	53
3.4.2	Production Resources	60
3.4.3	Operation Resources	65
3.4.4	End-of-Life Resources	67
3.4.5	Life Cycle Resources	69
3.4.6	Emission Inventory	69
3.5	Eco-Efficiency Assessment of CSR-02 and Interpretation	76
3.5.1	Reference Aircraft CSR-02	76
3.5.2	Economic Assessment	79
3.5.3	Environmental Assessment	86
3.5.4	Discussion of Results	94
4	Streamlined Sustainability Assessment Methodology	97
4.1	Goal and Scope Definition	97
4.2	Indicator Selection and Quantification	98
4.2.1	Economic Efficiency	99
4.2.2	Volume of Transport	99
4.2.3	Air Pollution	99
4.2.4	Climate Impact	101
4.2.5	Noise Pollution	104
4.2.6	Comfort	106
4.2.7	Indicator Overview	108
4.3	Multi-Criteria Decision Analysis	109
5	Case Study	111
5.1	Sustainability Assessment of CSR-02	111
5.2	Mission Modification for Sustainability	114
5.3	Retrofit	119
5.4	Aircraft Redesign	121
5.5	Discussion of Results	128
6	Conclusion and Outlook	131
	Bibliography	135

A	Life Cycle Costing Equations	157
A.1	NRC Method	157
A.2	RC Method	158
A.3	TOC Method	161
A.3.1	IOC	161
A.3.2	DOC	161
B	Emission Inventory	167
B.1	Static Databases	167
B.2	Specific Humidity	170
C	CSR-02 Study	171
C.1	s-EEA Study	173
C.2	s-LCSA Study	174
D	Air Pollution Data	177